



Risk-Informed, Performance Based Industrial Fire Protection
An Alternative to Prescriptive Codes by Thomas F. Barry, P.E.

Table of Contents



Preface	v
From the Author	vii
Acknowledgments	ix
Acronyms	xxiii

Chapter 1 – PROGRAM OBJECTIVES

1.1	INTRODUCTION	1 – 1
	1.1.1 Risk Defined	1 – 2
	<i>Unmitigated Risk Versus Mitigated Risk</i>	1 – 4
1.2	RISK-BASED DECISION MAKING	1 – 6
1.3	METHODOLOGY AND STEPS	1 – 9
	1.3.1 Risk-Informed, Performance-Based Fire Protection Steps	1 – 12
	1.3.2 Comparison with the SFPE Performance-Based Approach	1 – 18
1.4	PROJECT MANAGEMENT ISSUES	1 – 19
	1.4.1 Project Definition	1 – 20
	1.4.2 Project Team Selection	1 – 20
	1.4.3 Resource Allocation	1 – 22
1.5	RISK COMMUNICATION	1 – 25
1.6	REFERENCES	1 – 27

Chapter 2 – RISK TOLERANCE CRITERIA

2.1	INTRODUCTION	2 – 1
	2.1.1 Bottom-Up or Top-Down Approach	2 – 2
	2.1.2 Risk Tolerance Objectives	2 – 3
2.2	FINANCIAL IMPACT RISK TOLERANCE	2 – 6
	2.2.1 Annualized Financial Impact Risk	2 – 6
	<i>Fire and Explosion Viewed as a Financial Risk</i>	2 – 6
2.3	EXPOSURE LEVEL RISK TOLERANCE	2 – 13
	2.3.1 Life Safety Risk Tolerance	2 – 13
	2.3.2 Business Interruption Risk Tolerance	2 – 22
	2.3.3 Establishing Consequence Categories	2 – 25
	<i>Property Damage</i>	2 – 26
	<i>Environmental Damage</i>	2 – 26
	2.3.4 Establishing Likelihoods	2 – 27
	2.3.5 Discussion on Loss Expectancy	2 – 29
	<i>The Move Towards Risk-Based Loss Expectancy Estimates</i> ..	2 – 30
2.4	SOME KEY POINTS	2 – 32
2.5	REFERENCES	2 – 33

Chapter 3 – LOSS SCENARIO DEVELOPMENT

3.1	INTRODUCTION	3 – 1
3.2	SEQUENCE OF EVENTS	3 – 2
	3.2.1 Some Examples	3 – 7
3.3	EVENT TREE STRUCTURING	3 – 9
	3.3.1 ETA Steps	3 – 10
	3.3.2 Example Industrial Building ETA Structure	3 – 20
	3.3.3 Example Exterior Exposure ETA Structure	3 – 23
	3.3.4 Example Off-Site Risk ETA Structure	3 – 25
3.4	SCENARIO SCREENING	3 – 28
	3.4.1 Phase 1, Extensive List of Scenarios	3 – 29
	3.4.2 Phase 2, Scenario Grouping	3 – 30
	3.4.3 Phase 3, Scenario Screening	3 – 34
	<i>Risk Screening Approach</i>	3 – 34
	<i>Risk Screening Matrix</i>	3 – 36
	<i>Action Item Summary</i>	3 – 38

	3.4.4 Phase 4, Selection of Scenarios for Quantitative Analysis	3 – 39
	3.4.5 Fire Event Classification	3 – 39
3.5	DISCUSSION	3 – 42
	<i>Site Surveys & Interviews</i>	3 – 43
	<i>Historical Data Review</i>	3 – 43
3.6	REFERENCES	3 – 44

Chapter 4 – INITIATING EVENT LIKELIHOOD

4.1	INTRODUCTION	4 – 1
	<i>Risk Estimation Refresher</i>	4 – 3
4.2	HISTORICAL DATA	4 – 6
	<i>Plant Specific Incident Data</i>	4 – 6
	4.2.1 Industry Specific Incident Data	4 – 12
	<i>Example of Some Historical Data</i>	4 – 16
	4.2.2 Use of Failure Rate Data	4 – 18
	<i>Combining Failure Rates from Multiple Data Bases</i>	4 – 21
4.3	FAULT TREE ANALYSIS (FTA)	4 – 24
	4.3.1 Fault Tree Basics	4 – 27
	<i>FTA Steps</i>	4 – 29
	4.3.2 Qualitative Fault Tree Structuring	4 – 35
	4.3.3 FTA Computer Software	4 – 38
4.4	EQUIPMENT FAILURES	4 – 39
	4.4.1 Failure Data Sources	4 – 41
	<i>Plant Specific Data</i>	4 – 41
	<i>Equipment Manufacturers' Data</i>	4 – 42
	<i>Published Failure Rate Data</i>	4 – 43
	4.4.2 Pre-Fire Mitigation Safeguards	4 – 51
	<i>Emergency Control Systems</i>	4 – 52
	4.4.3 Modifying Equipment Failure Rate Data	4 – 55
	<i>Performance Integrity Measures (PIMs)</i>	4 – 56
	<i>An Overview of Some (PIMs)</i>	4 – 57
	<i>PIM Quality Scoring</i>	4 – 61
	<i>Relating PIM GPA Score to Failure Point Selection</i>	4 – 65
4.5	HUMAN ERROR	4 – 68
	4.5.1 Human Error Data	4 – 70
4.6	EXTERNAL EVENTS	4 – 72

4.6.1	Earthquake	4 – 73
4.6.2	Security	4 – 75
4.7	OXYGEN AVAILABILITY	4 – 75
4.7.1	Oxygen Concentration Reduction	4 – 77
	<i>Combustible Dust</i>	4 – 79
4.8	IGNITION	4 – 81
4.8.1	Ignition Fault Tree Logic	4 – 82
	<i>Ignition Source of Sufficient Strength is Present in Exposure Zone</i>	4 – 83
4.8.2	Ignition Source Identification	4 – 85
	<i>Industry and Generic Incident Data Bases</i>	4 – 92
4.8.3	Ignition Source Strength	4 – 93
	<i>Autoignition Temperature</i>	4 – 93
	<i>Time Ignition Source is Present</i>	4 – 97
	<i>Ignition Source Control Systems</i>	4 – 98
4.8.4	Ignition Likelihood and Engineering Judgement	4 – 100
	<i>Likelihood Selection Basis</i>	4 – 102
4.8.5	Summary	4 – 105
4.9	LIKELIHOOD CATEGORIZATION	4 – 106
4.9.1	Scenario Input	4 – 109
4.9.2	Historical Data Bandwidth	4 – 110
4.9.3	Control System Reliability	4 – 111
4.9.4	Ignition Source Potential	4 – 114
4.9.5	Establishing Fire Event Frequency and Likelihood Category Ranges	4 – 114
4.9.6	Documentation	4 – 117
4.10	DISCUSSION	4 – 120
4.11	REFERENCES	4 – 122

Chapter 5 – EXPOSURE PROFILE MODELING

5.1	INTRODUCTION	5 – 1
	<i>Risk Estimation Refresher</i>	5 – 3
5.1.1	Exposure Profile Modeling Approach	5 – 4
5.2	TARGET THRESHOLD DAMAGE LIMITS	5 – 7
5.2.1	Life Safety Exposure and TDLs	5 – 9
	<i>Radiant Heat</i>	5 – 10
	<i>Convective Heat Exposure</i>	5 – 11

	<i>Effects of Oxygen Depletion</i>	5 – 13
	<i>Toxic Products of Combustion</i>	5 – 13
	<i>Visibility Through Smoke</i>	5 – 15
5.2.2	Property Threshold Damage Limits	5 – 15
	<i>Equipment</i>	5 – 16
	<i>Stock</i>	5 – 17
	<i>Structures</i>	5 – 18
	<i>Radiant Heat Exposure</i>	5 – 19
	<i>Electrical Cables</i>	5 – 23
	<i>Electronic Equipment</i>	5 – 24
	<i>Glass</i>	5 – 24
	<i>Steel</i>	5 – 25
	<i>Concrete</i>	5 – 27
	<i>Example TDL Worksheet</i>	5 – 28
	<i>Modeling and Computer Simulation</i>	5 – 29
5.2.3	Explosion Overpressure Effects	5 – 33
5.3	TIME LINE PARAMETERS AND CONSEQUENCE LEVELS	5 – 37
5.3.1	Evaluating System Functional Requirements	5 – 37
5.3.2	Modeling Fire Source Intensity	5 – 40
	<i>Exposure to Target Subsystems</i>	5 – 40
	<i>Exposure to Control Room Operator</i>	5 – 42
	<i>Exposure to Control Room Equipment</i>	5 – 45
5.3.3	Damage Limiting Conditions and Time Line Parameters	5 – 48
5.3.4	Categorizing Event Tree Consequence Levels	5 – 53
	<i>Life Safety</i>	5 – 53
	<i>Evasive Action</i>	5 – 56
	<i>Property Damage</i>	5 – 57
	<i>Business Interruption</i>	5 – 60
	<i>Environmental Damage</i>	5 – 64
5.4	COMPARTMENT FIRE MODELS	5 – 66
5.4.1	Source ÷ Pathway ÷ Target	5 – 66
5.4.2	Some Fire Calculation Concepts	5 – 70
	<i>Flame Height</i>	5 – 71
	<i>Fire Plume/Ceiling Jet Correlations</i>	5 – 72
5.4.3	Zone Fire Models	5 – 74
5.4.4	Issues and Limitations of Zone Fire Models	5 – 76
5.4.5	Field Fire Models	5 – 77
	<i>Summary</i>	5 – 83
5.5	INITIAL HEAT RELEASE RATE EVALUATION	5 – 84
5.5.1	Initial Fuel Source	5 – 85

5.5.2	Fire Growth of Initial Fuel Package	5 – 88
	<i>t² Fire Uncertainty Issues</i>	5 – 90
5.5.3	Peak HRR of the Initial Fuel Package	5 – 90
	<i>Estimating Pool Fire Diameters for Unconfined Spills</i>	5 – 93
	<i>Fire Burning Time</i>	5 – 95
	<i>Torch Fires</i>	5 – 95
5.5.4	Solid Material HRR	5 – 96
5.5.5	Peak HRR Importance	5 – 99
5.6	SECONDARY FUEL SOURCES	5 – 100
5.6.1	Radiant Heat Exposure	5 – 101
	<i>Solid Flame Radiation Model</i>	5 – 104
5.7	SPECIAL HAZARD EXPOSURE MODELING	5 – 109
5.7.1	Characterize the Release	5 – 110
5.7.2	Incident Outcomes	5 – 112
	<i>Ignition</i>	5 – 114
	<i>Blast Wave Generation</i>	5 – 116
	<i>Flame Impingement</i>	5 – 117
5.7.3	Exposure Modeling	5 – 117
	<i>Torch Fire</i>	5 – 117
	<i>BLEVE</i>	5 – 119
	<i>Flash Fire Exposure</i>	5 – 120
	<i>Vapor Cloud Explosion Exposure</i>	5 – 121
5.7.4	Relating Consequence Levels	5 – 122
	<i>Computerized Models</i>	5 – 126
5.8	DISCUSSION	5 – 127
5.9	REFERENCES	5 – 129
	<i>References for Table 5.39, A Listing of Some Field Fire Models, Chap. 5</i>	5 – 132

Chapter 6 – Fire Protection System Performance Success Probability

6.1	INTRODUCTION	6 – 1
	<i>Risk Estimation Refresher</i>	6 – 3
6.1.1	The Performance Concept	6 – 4
6.1.2	Performance Measures	6 – 7
	<i>Success Tree Analysis</i>	6 – 9
6.1.3	Modeling Framework	6 – 16

6.2	RESPONSE EFFECTIVENESS	6 – 18
6.2.1	Design Application Basis	6 – 18
6.2.2	Suitability	6 – 20
	<i>Detection Systems</i>	6 – 21
	<i>Emergency Control Systems</i>	6 – 21
	<i>Fire Suppression Systems</i>	6 – 22
6.2.3	Capacity Effectiveness	6 – 23
6.2.4	Duration	6 – 26
6.2.5	Probability	6 – 27
6.2.6	System Response Time	6 – 28
	<i>Refresher</i>	6 – 29
6.2.7	FPS Response Time Evaluation Methods	6 – 34
	<i>Deterministic Modeling</i>	6 – 34
6.2.8	SRT Probability Selection	6 – 35
	<i>Explosion Suppression Systems</i>	6 – 37
	<i>Summary</i>	6 – 38
6.3	ON-LINE AVAILABILITY	6 – 39
	<i>Performance Measures</i>	6 – 41
6.3.1	Off-Line Due To Inspection, Maintenance, Proof Testing	6 – 42
6.3.2	Off-Line Due To False Trips	6 – 43
6.3.3	Off-Line Due To “Other” Conditions	6 – 44
	<i>Adverse Weather Conditions</i>	6 – 44
	<i>Unscheduled Repairs</i>	6 – 45
6.4	OPERATIONAL RELIABILITY EVALUATION LOGIC	6 – 45
6.4.1	Qualitative Logic Structuring	6 – 49
	<i>Automatic Detection Systems</i>	6 – 51
	<i>Emergency Control Systems (ECS)</i>	6 – 53
	<i>Water-Based Fire Suppression Systems</i>	6 – 58
	<i>Fire Barriers</i>	6 – 61
6.4.2	Operational Reliability (OPR) and Common Cause Failures (CCFs)	6 – 64
	<i>Internal Design-Related Failure Potential</i>	6 – 65
6.5	OPERATIONAL RELIABILITY QUANTIFICATION	6 – 67
6.5.1	Probability Documentation Table	6 – 68
	<i>Description</i>	6 – 68
	<i>Mean Failure Rate</i>	6 – 68
6.5.2	Performance Integrity Measure (PIM) Failure Rate Adjustment	6 – 72
	<i>General Design Standards</i>	6 – 75
	<i>Life-Cycle (Age)</i>	6 – 75
	<i>Management of Change (MOC) Program</i>	6 – 76
	<i>Inspection and Maintenance Programs</i>	6 – 76
	<i>Proof Testing</i>	6 – 76

	<i>Operating Environment</i>	6 – 79
	<i>Redundancy</i>	6 – 79
	<i>Diagnostics (Fault Detection Capability)</i>	6 – 79
	<i>Performance Integrity Measure (PIM) Quality Scoring</i>	6 – 80
	<i>Importance</i>	6 – 80
6.5.3	Failure Data Sources	6 – 89
	<i>Plant Specific Data</i>	6 – 89
	<i>Equipment Manufacturers Data</i>	6 – 91
	<i>Published Failure Rate Data</i>	6 – 92
	<i>Equipment Boundaries</i>	6 – 94
	<i>Failure Mode Definition</i>	6 – 94
6.6	REDUNDANCY AND INADVERTENT OPERATION	6 – 98
	6.6.1 Redundant or Back-Up Equipment	6 – 98
	6.6.2 Inadvertent Operation	6 – 101
	<i>Inadvertent Operation Data</i>	6 – 103
6.7	MANUAL INTERVENTION	6 – 104
	6.7.1 Performance Evaluation Factors	6 – 106
	<i>Design Application Basis (DAB)</i>	6 – 106
	<i>Availability</i>	6 – 107
	<i>Human Response Failure</i>	6 – 108
	<i>The Reduction of Manual Intervention, Human Error</i>	6 – 110
	6.7.2 Fire Fighting	6 – 111
6.8	PERFORMANCE INTEGRITY-BASED RELIABILITY LEVELS	6 – 114
	6.8.1 Review of Applicable Design Codes, Standards, Practices	6 – 115
	6.8.2 Reliability Data Review	6 – 116
	6.8.3 Quality Scoring of FPS Performance Integrity Measures	6 – 117
	6.8.4 FPS Reliability Estimate	6 – 117
6.9	Discussion	6 – 119
	<i>Fire Protection System Interfaces</i>	6 – 120
	<i>Use of a Computer Program Model</i>	6 – 121
	<i>Performance and Risk Management</i>	6 – 122
	<i>Summary</i>	6 – 122
6.10	REFERENCES	6 – 123

Chapter 7 – RISK ESTIMATION AND COMPARISON

7.1	INTRODUCTION	7 – 1
-----	--------------------	-------

	<i>Risk Estimation Refresher</i>	7 – 2
7.2	RISK CALCULATION	7 – 3
	7.2.1 Branch Line Probabilities	7 – 3
	7.2.2 Aggregate Equivalent Monetary Values	7 – 6
	<i>Property Damage</i>	7 – 8
	<i>Business Interruption</i>	7 – 11
	<i>Life Safety Exposure</i>	7 – 13
	<i>Environmental Damage</i>	7 – 15
	<i>Other Consequence Considerations</i>	7 – 16
	7.2.3 Annualized Risk	7 – 17
	<i>Total Annualized Risk</i>	7 – 19
	<i>Annualized Risk Grouped by Loss Expectancy Scenarios of Interest</i>	7 – 19
	<i>Likelihood of Exceeding a Defined Consequence Level</i>	7 – 21
	<i>Risk Summation</i>	7 – 23
7.3	RISK COMPARISON	7 – 26
	<i>Comparison with the Total Annualized Risk Estimate</i>	7 – 26
	<i>Comparison with Loss Expectancy Risk Tolerance Profile</i>	7 – 27
	<i>Likelihood of Exceeding a Defined Consequence Level</i>	7 – 28
	<i>Life Safety Risk Comparison</i>	7 – 29
	<i>Individual Risk Contours</i>	7 – 30
7.4	RISK UNCERTAINTY	7 – 31
	<i>Interactive Team Reviews</i>	7 – 31
	<i>Documentation</i>	7 – 34
	7.4.1 Computer Spreadsheet Modeling	7 – 37
	<i>What-If Analysis Versus Monte Carlo Simulation</i>	7 – 37
	7.4.2 Monte Carlo Simulation	7 – 40
	<i>Random Variables and Probability Distribution</i>	7 – 42
	<i>A Short Example</i>	7 – 43
	<i>Assigning RNG Probability Distributions</i>	7 – 44
	<i>Summary</i>	7 – 52
7.5	REFERENCES	7 – 52

Chapter 8 – COST/BENEFIT ANALYSIS OF RISK REDUCTION ALTERNATIVES

8.1	INTRODUCTION	8 – 1
	<i>Weak Links and Brain-Storming</i>	8 – 2
8.2	REDUCING INITIATING EVENT LIKELIHOOD	8 – 6
	8.2.1 Evaluating Likelihood Reduction	8 – 9
	8.2.2 Evaluate the Feasibility of Likelihood Reduction Options	8 – 11
	8.2.3 Operator Error	8 – 14
	8.2.4 Ignition Likelihood	8 – 18
	8.2.5 Quantification of Likelihood Modifications	8 – 20
8.3	FIRE PROTECTION SYSTEM PERFORMANCE IMPROVEMENT	8 – 23
	8.3.1 Improving Performance Success of a Water Spray System	8 – 30
	<i>Design Application Basis</i>	8 – 31
	<i>System Response Time</i>	8 – 33
	<i>On-Line Availability</i>	8 – 35
	<i>Operational Reliability</i>	8 – 36
	<i>Operational Reliability – Performance Integrity Measures</i> ..	8 – 38
	<i>Relating PIM Scores to Failure-On-Demand Probability</i>	8 – 40
	<i>Existing Water Spray System – Opportunities for Improvement</i> ..	8 – 46
8.4	CONSEQUENCE MODIFICATION	8 – 50
	8.4.1 Material Substitution	8 – 50
	<i>Combustible Solids</i>	8 – 58
	8.4.2 Modify Life Safety Exposure Levels	8 – 58
	8.4.3 Modify Business Interruption (BI) Impact Levels	8 – 63
8.5	COST/BENEFIT ANALYSIS OF RISK REDUCTION ALTERNATIVES	8 – 68
	8.5.1 Quantification of Risk Reduction Alternatives	8 – 68
	<i>How Much Risk Reduction is Needed?</i>	8 – 68
	<i>What-If Analysis</i>	8 – 71
	<i>Uncertainty</i>	8 – 78
	8.5.2 Cost Analysis for Selected Risk Reduction Strategies	8 – 79
	8.5.3 Risk Reduction Benefit/Cost Ratios	8 – 84
	<i>Benefit/Cost Ratio – Risk Reduction Strategy 4</i>	8 – 85
	<i>Benefit/Cost Ratio – Risk Reduction Strategy 11</i>	8 – 86
	<i>Benefit/Cost Ratio – Risk Reduction Strategy 15</i>	8 – 86
8.6	DECISION MAKING	8 – 87
	<i>Decision Maker’s Preferences</i>	8 – 88

	<i>Decision Analysis Tools</i>	8 – 89
	<i>Analytic Hierarchy Process</i>	8 – 89
	<i>“Pairwise” Comparison</i>	8 – 89
8.7	RISK MONITORING	8 – 94
	8.7.1 Installation and Start-Up Risk Control	8 – 94
	8.7.2 Operational Risk Monitoring	8 – 95
	<i>Equipment Inspection, Maintenance, Testing (IMT) Programs</i>	8 – 96
	<i>Fire Safety Self-Inspection</i>	8 – 97
	8.7.3 FPS Impairments	8 – 97
	<i>Assess Fire System Impairment Effects with Event Tree Analysis</i>	8 – 98
	8.7.4 Performance Feedback	8 – 100
8.8	REFERENCES	8 – 101

Chapter 9 – MOVING FORWARD

9.1	INTRODUCTION	9 – 1
9.2	TAKING ACTION	9 – 3
9.3	FIRE RISK FORUM	9 – 5
9.4	REFERENCES	9 – 8
	INDEX	I – 1